

Future-Value Assessment of a Multi-Facility Allocation Problem with Inventory Return Costs

Jonathan David Aguirre Bello, Oscar Flores Carreto, Ninfa Alejandra Guzmán Velasco, Ricardo Ernesto Morales Guerrero, Santiago Omar Caballero Morales

¹ Universidad Popular Autónoma del Estado de Puebla A.C., 17 Sur 901, Barrio de Santiago, 72410, Puebla, México

jonathandavid.aguirre@upaep.edu.mx, oscar.flores2@upaep.edu.mx, ninfaalejandra.guzman@upaep.edu.mx, ricardoernesto.morales@upaep.edu.mx, santiagoomar.caballero@upaep.mx

| Abstract, Decision models within the logistic field are crucial for | Article Info |
|--|-------------------------|
| the optimization of economic resources throughout the supply | Received Dec 15, 2020 |
| the optimization of economic resources unoughout the suppry | Received Dec 13, 2020 |
| chain. In this context, facility allocation is important to achieve an | Accepted April 30, 2021 |
| efficient distribution network. The present work extends on the | |
| multi-facility allocation problem by integrating the time- | |
| dependent costs associated with the dynamic behaviour of | |
| inventory management and transportation through a planning | |
| horizon. These costs are evaluated by considering their future | |
| value in different periods and an integrated cost metric, including | |
| distance, supply frequency, and fuel performance. The | |
| contribution of this approach leads to support the decision process | |
| regarding the viability of the investment required to establish a set | |
| of facilities in terms of future costs, how these costs may increase | |
| if the decision is delayed, and when the investment is to be | |
| compensated by the savings obtained by the solution of the multi- | |
| facility allocation problem. | |
| Keywords: multi-facility allocation problem, inventory control, | |
| future value, logistics | |

1 Introduction

Various efforts have been made to improve supply chain operations and to develop practical tools and models to improve competitiveness. This has implied the use of mathematical models for decision making that directly involves the optimization of resources. Among these models, some contribute to the design of distribution networks by integrating variables such as demographic data, times, capacities and restrictions. Among the most important aspects in solving problems related to distribution networks is that all services and products require efficient delivery to customers and industries [1].

An important aspect of achieving efficient delivery of goods is through the effective facility location-allocation of customers to distribution centers. In general, goods and resources should be allocated to close facilities, distribution centers, and/or customers to avoid setbacks, resulting in high-cost charges and ensuring that raw materials arrive on time [2]. Thus, facilities must be located at the most strategic places to ensure that the allocated companies have the appropriate infrastructure and means of transportation for the delivery of goods and/or services [3, 4]. The strategy must be supported by formal decision models as uncertainty and vagueness directly impact the economic assets of the company [5].

The facility location-allocation problem is frequently solved considering just distances from customers to distribution centers and opening costs. However, the design of a comprehensive supply chain network involves more elements which, if unified, can lead to more significant savings [6, 7]. Particularly, it is important to consider inventory management because it involves transportation and inventory supply costs which are frequently absent from standard facility location-allocation problems.

The issue of managing investment for inventories may have more relevance compared to the decision to invest in the business itself. Good economic management, well-thought-out decision-making and inventory planning are vitally important to avoid financial problems after opening or starting a company's operations. In this context, considering the time-dependent aspect of costs can support the viability of this decision process and evaluate the additional costs of postponing the opening or starting operations.

Thus, the present work extends on the multi-facility allocation problem by integrating the time-dependent costs associated to the dynamic behavior of inventory management and transportation through a planning horizon. The allocation strategy of six distribution centers is performed by considering an integrated cost metric which includes distance from the distribution centers to customers, fuel consumption, appropriate inventory levels required by the allocated customers, the optimal number of transfers, and the investment required to operate the distribution centers. The integrated costs are evaluated by considering their future value in different periods to determine how these costs may increase if the decision is delayed, and when the investment is to be compensated by the savings obtained by the solution of the multi-facility allocation problem.

This work is structured as follows: Section 2 presents the development of the integrated cost metric and the multi-facility allocation model. Then, Section 3 presents its application for a case study. Results are presented in Section 4 with a discussion of future-value assessment. Finally, in Section 5 our conclusions and future work are presented.

2 Integrated Cost Metric

Distribution frequency is determined by the supply requirements of the allocated customers. An inventory control policy frequently determines this. For example, consider the Economic Order Quantity (EOQ) model, which determines the purchase order quantity for replenishment. The main objective is to minimize total inventory costs [8]. The EOQ model considers the variables presented in Table 1.

| | Table 1. Variables and costs considered by the EOQ model |
|------------------|--|
| Variable | Description |
| D | Cumulative demand (units of product) through a planning horizon |
| S | Order or enlist cost (\$ per lot of products) |
| С | Cost of the unit of product (\$ per unit of product) |
| i | Maintenance rate (% per unit of product) |
| $H = i \times C$ | Maintenance cost (\$ per average units of products) |
| Q | $EOQ = Q = sqrt((2 \times D \times S)/H)$ size of economic lot |
| R | Reorder point (units of product in inventory) |
| N | Number of orders through a planning horizon $N = D/Q$ |
| Т | Time between each order (Planning Horizon / N) |
| TC | Total Inventory Management Costs = $(D/Q) \times S + (Q/2) \times H$ |

For each customer *j*, through a planning horizon, N_j orders must be filled or supplied. As these orders require transportation, the distribution centre's total trips to a customer are determined as $2 \times N_j$ (inbound+outbound trips). Then, if d_{ij} is defined as the distance in km between the distribution center *i* and customer *j*, a transportation fare per km (*f*) can be applied to determine the transportation cost associated with each inbound/outbound trip. Note that *f* may include such concepts as: fuel consumption cost associated with the transportation vehicle, drivers' wage, and toll fare.

Finally, the transportation cost between any distribution center i and a customer j through a planning horizon (which is defined by the calculation of D) can be determined as:

$$C_{ij} = 2 \times N_j \times d_{ij} \times f \tag{1}$$

Note that C_{ij} is set in a cost matrix of dimensions $n \times m$ and the values within it depend on the location of the distribution centers if these are part of the decision problem (multi-facility location problem). Also, as d_{ij} is expected to be in km (kilometers), an approximate distance metric such as the spherical arc length metric can be considered. Figure 1 presents the model and calculations for this metric. Here, φ and λ represent the geophysical latitude and longitude respectively in radians of a location, and r is the radius of the Earth which is estimated as 6371 km.



Fig. 1. Spherical model of the Earth with arc length metric.

Regarding the future value of this cost to specific periods, this can be estimated by: $FV = PV \times (1 + k)^t$.

(2)

Here, PV is the present value of the economic entity, t is the number of future periods, and k is the interest rate for each period. Note that (2) implies a compound interest, leading to the FV increasing exponentially with time [9]. For this case:

$$FC_{ij} = \mathbf{C}_{ij} \times (1+k)^{\mathrm{t}},\tag{3}$$

where t is the number of periods based on the planning horizon. Thus, if D is estimated annually, then t would be the number of years in the future.

Finally, the objective function for the multi-facility allocation problem model can be defined as:

$$\operatorname{Min} \Sigma^{n}_{i=1} \Sigma^{m}_{i=1} X_{ij} \times C_{ij} + \operatorname{Initial Investment},$$
(4)

where X_{ij} is a binary decision variable which is equal to 1 if the customer *j* is allocated (or assigned) to distribution center *i* and 0 otherwise, the *Initial Investment* is the economic resource required to open and operate the distribution centers, and *n* and *m* are the number of distribution centers and customers respectively. Then, the restrictions for the model are the following:

$$\Sigma^{n}_{i=1}X_{ij} = 1$$
, for all j=1, ..., m (5)

$$X_{ij} \in \{0, 1\}$$
 for all i=1, ..., n and j=1, ..., m (6)

$$O_i \in \{0, 1\}$$
 for all i=1, ..., n (7)

3 Application Case

The proposed model was applied to a case study with the following data:

- There are 170 branches (customers) of a company that sells various products $(P_1 P_{10})$. Figure 2 presents the visualization of the locations of these branches.
- All branches are supplied by a single distribution center at geographical coordinates (-97.84167, 19.13648).
- The costs associated with transportation and inventory management are presented in Table 2.
- The two-week demand of customers for products $P_1 P_{10}$ is presented in Table 3. Based on the inventory management costs reported in Table 2, the lost quantity Q and the supply frequency for each customer (N_j) through a planning horizon of one year is also reported in Table 3.
- The investment required to open and operate a distribution center is estimated at USD 50,000.
- The annual increase in operating costs is estimated at 7.5% per year.

From data of Table 2, the transportation *f* per km is estimated as 3.5 + 1.2 + 1.0 =\$ 5.7 USD. Additionally, as presented in Table 3, the total inventory management costs associated with supplying all customers is estimated as USD 54,864.13. On the other hand, by using Eq. (1), the total transportation cost of supplying all customers from the distribution center located at (-97.84167, 19.13648) is estimated as USD 5,193,684.42.



Fig. 2. Location of customers (branches) and current distribution center of the case study.

| Table 2. Tran | sportation and | inventory | management | cost variables of t | he case study. |
|---------------|----------------|-----------|------------|---------------------|----------------|
|---------------|----------------|-----------|------------|---------------------|----------------|

| Variable | Value |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Fuel consumption cost | \$ 3.5 USD per km |
| Toll rate | \$ 50.0 USD per 50 km |
| Drivers' wage | \$ 1.2 USD per km |
| S - order cost | \$ 30.0 USD per lot |
| H – maintenance cost | \$ 0.1 USD per unit |

At this point, these costs represent the baseline to evaluate the outcomes of the proposed approach. As previously presented, six new distribution centers are considered to improve supply to all customers. Based on the customers' location patterns presented in Figure 2, four centres were considered within this region with a clear concentration of branches in the central region. The remaining two centers were considered for the north and south region respectively. In this way, the following geographical coordinates were proposed to locate the six new distribution centers:

- Center 1 at (-106.005266799872, 28.7256313837228)
- Center 2 at (-103.721434054928, 23.2828422409267)
- Center 3 at (-103.162899197525, 20.5931860949597)
- Center 4 at (-99.0422696081225, 18.9716879632598)
- Center 5 at (-97.6283993446507, 21.0445494410414)
- Center 6 at (-90.387700643573, 17.930095196719)

With these centers, the multi-facility allocation problem was solved by using the mathematical formulation defined by Eq. (4) – (7). Here, two solving approaches were considered:

- a) Solving based on a nearest-neighbour logic.
- b) Solving through mixed linear integer programming (MILP). For this case, Eq. (4) (7) were implemented with the optimization software Lingo v. 19.0.

Figure 3 presents the allocation of customers to each center based on both approaches. Also, the associated costs of both solutions are presented. Note that both solutions, involve an initial investment of six centers \times \$ 50,000 USD = \$ 300,000.00 USD.

| Table 3. Source invento | ry data and economic lot | quantity and | d supply frequenc | y for customers of | of the case study. |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|--------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| | / | | | / | |

| b | | | | two-weeks demands | | | | one-year demand | | | | two-weeks demands | | | | | | one-year demand | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|----------|----------|----------|-------------------|----------|----------------|----------------|--------------------|----------------|-----------|-----------------|---------------------|----------------|------|--------------|------------------|-----|--------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------|-----------------|-------------------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|
| 1 | # | P1 | P2 | P3 | P4 | P ₅ | P ₆ | P ₇ | P ₈ | P9 | P ₁₀ | $\Sigma^{10} = P_r$ | D | 0 | N = D/Q | TC | # | P1 | P2 | P3 | P_4 | P ₅ | P ₆ | P ₇ | P ₈ | P9 | P ₁₀ | $\Sigma_{r=1}^{10} P_r$ | D | 0 | N = D/Q | TC |
| | 1 | 81 | 81 | 53 | 37 | 110 | 81 | 70 | 134 | 112 | 82 | 841 | 21866 | 3622 | 6.04 | 362.21 | 86 | 84 | 52 | 54 | 45 | 56 | 58 | 31 | 56 | 58 | 31 | 525 | 13650 | 2862 | 4.77 | 286.18 |
| 1 | 2 | 71 | 81 | 58 | 31 | 125 | 100 | 65 | 155 | 120 | 74 | 880 | 22880 | 3705 | 6.18 | 370.51 | 87 | 81 | 73 | 59 | 46 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 547 | 14222 | 2921 | 4.87 | 292.12 |
| N N N N N N N N N N N | 3 | 77 | 86 | 59 | 31 | 72 | 57 | 32 | 59 | 103 | 120 | 696 | 18096 | 3295 | 5.49 | 329.51 | 88 | 75 | 78 | 56 | 49 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 568 | 14768 | 2977 | 4.96 | 297.67 |
| | 4 | 89 | 89 50 | 54 52 | 48 | 86 86 | 5/ | 35 56 | 55 | 3/ | 03 | 650 | 16900 | 3184 | 5.31 | 318.43 | 89 | 50 63 | 89 80 | 55 54 | 48 | 60 122 | 52 | 46 30 | 60 54 | 52 48 | 46 60 | 558 603 | 14508 | 2950 | 4.92 | 295.04 |
| 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1< | 6 | 66 | 82 | 53 | 30 | 77 | 53 | 69 | 59 | 31 | 86 | 606 | 15756 | 3075 | 5.12 | 307.47 | 91 | 58 | 89 | 52 | 45 | 109 | 56 | 50 | 52 | 46 | 134 | 691 | 17966 | 3283 | 5.47 | 328.32 |
| i | 7 | 64 | 73 | 56 | 50 | 70 | 54 | 42 | 54 | 48 | 117 | 628 | 16328 | 3130 | 5.22 | 313.00 | 92 | 53 | 86 | 57 | 43 | 101 | 51 | 39 | 53 | 30 | 59 | 572 | 14872 | 2987 | 4.98 | 298.72 |
| 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 <t< td=""><td>8</td><td>72</td><td>57</td><td>51</td><td>39</td><td>76</td><td>57</td><td>36</td><td>52</td><td>46</td><td>105</td><td>591</td><td>15366</td><td>3036</td><td>5.06</td><td>303.64</td><td>93</td><td>81</td><td>89</td><td>60</td><td>30</td><td>89</td><td>73</td><td>53</td><td>56</td><td>50</td><td>124</td><td>705</td><td>18330</td><td>3316</td><td>5.53</td><td>331.63</td></t<> | 8 | 72 | 57 | 51 | 39 | 76 | 57 | 36 | 52 | 46 | 105 | 591 | 15366 | 3036 | 5.06 | 303.64 | 93 | 81 | 89 | 60 | 30 | 89 | 73 | 53 | 56 | 50 | 124 | 705 | 18330 | 3316 | 5.53 | 331.63 |
| 10 10 10 10 10 | 9 | 86 | 57 | 56 | 37 | 74 | 54 | 59 | 53 | 30 | 72 | 578 | 15028 | 3003 | 5.00 | 300.28 | 94 | 66 | 79 | 59 | 45 | 60 | 86 | 62 | 51 | 39 | 127 | 674 | 17524 | 3243 | 5.40 | 324.26 |
| 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10 | 11 | 80 77 | 53 | 54 | 33 | 58 | 31 | 32 | 51 | 39 | 106 | 534 | 13884 | 2929 | 4.80 | 292.92 | 95 | 56 | 74 | 59 | 36 | 130 | 75 81 | 31 | 59 | 31 | 56 | 613 | 15938 | 3092 | 5.14 | 309.24 |
| 1 5 1 2 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 | 12 | 70 | 54 | 53 | 49 | 59 | 89 | 92 | 53 | 37 | 87 | 643 | 16718 | 3167 | 5.28 | 316.71 | 97 | 72 | 57 | 60 | 33 | 124 | 93 | 65 | 54 | 48 | 54 | 660 | 17160 | 3209 | 5.35 | 320.87 |
| 1 1 1 2 5 3 3 5 3 5 5 5 5 5 < | 13 | 76 | 57 | 51 | 42 | 54 | 139 | 99 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 737 | 19162 | 3391 | 5.65 | 339.08 | 98 | 86 | 57 | 57 | 34 | 60 | 90 | 52 | 52 | 46 | 53 | 587 | 15262 | 3026 | 5.04 | 302.61 |
| b | 14 | 74 | 54 | 56 | 38 | 52 | 89 | 80 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 691 | 17966 | 3283 | 5.47 | 328.32 | 99 | 86 | 56 | 54 | 32 | 135 | 83 | 54 | 53 | 30 | 125 | 708 | 18408 | 3323 | 5.54 | 332.34 |
| 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 < | 15 | 84 60 | 52 80 | 50 52 | 49 | 55 56 | 70 | 83 93 | 130 56 | 53 | 40 | 760 602 | 19/00 | 3065 | 5.74 | 344.33 306.45 | 100 | 70 | 53 54 | 52 57 | 41 30 | 00 116 | 99 87 | 48 49 | 50 | 58 | 31 | 576 | 14976 | 2998 | 5.00 | 299.76 |
| 1 1 1 1 < | 17 | 71 | 89 | 52 | 41 | 51 | 114 | 80 | 56 | 58 | 31 | 643 | 16718 | 3167 | 5.28 | 316.71 | 102 | 76 | 57 | 51 | 42 | 99 | 99 | 62 | 131 | 59 | 31 | 707 | 18382 | 3321 | 5.54 | 332.10 |
| 10 10 10 10 10 10 | 18 | 89 | 81 | 52 | 39 | 114 | 118 | 97 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 734 | 19084 | 3384 | 5.64 | 338.38 | 103 | 74 | 54 | 53 | 37 | 107 | 84 | 66 | 66 | 54 | 48 | 643 | 16718 | 3167 | 5.28 | 316.71 |
| 31 3 3 3 1 3 3 1 1 3 3 1 1 3 3 1 | 19 | 76 | 86 | 54 | 49 | 130 | 114 | 91 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 755 | 19630 | 3432 | 5.72 | 343.19 | 104 | 84 | 52 | 59 | 32 | 133 | 83 | 40 | 134 | 52 | 46 | 715 | 18590 | 3340 | 5.57 | 333.98 |
| 1 1 2 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 5 5 5 5 5 | 20 | 56 | 80 | 54 | 38 | 112 | 81 | 30 | 60 | 52 | 46 | 609 742 | 15834 | 3082 | 5.14 | 308.23 | 105 | 81 | 74 | 50 | 53 | 37 | 98 | 47 | 157 | 53 | 30 | 680 | 17680 | 3257 | 5.43 | 325.70 |
| 1 | 21 | 72 | 57 | 55 | 30 | 139 | 92 99 | 33 | 121 | 75 | 109 | 745 | 20722 | 3526 | 5.88 | 340.43 | 100 | 89 | 73 | 56 | 59 | 31 | 80 | 37 | 160 | 51 | 30 39 | 666 | 17316 | 3223 | 5.37 | 322.33 |
| 1 | 23 | 86 | 57 | 58 | 49 | 89 | 80 | 65 | 123 | 97 | 147 | 851 | 22126 | 3644 | 6.07 | 364.36 | 108 | 83 | 80 | 60 | 54 | 48 | 87 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 46 | 677 | 17602 | 3250 | 5.42 | 324.98 |
| 10 10 10 10 <td>24</td> <td>86</td> <td>56</td> <td>52</td> <td>35</td> <td>126</td> <td>83</td> <td>40</td> <td>56</td> <td>55</td> <td>105</td> <td>694</td> <td>18044</td> <td>3290</td> <td>5.48</td> <td>329.03</td> <td>109</td> <td>58</td> <td>90</td> <td>51</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>88</td> <td>93</td> <td>88</td> <td>67</td> <td>30</td> <td>663</td> <td>17238</td> <td>3216</td> <td>5.36</td> <td>321.60</td> | 24 | 86 | 56 | 52 | 35 | 126 | 83 | 40 | 56 | 55 | 105 | 694 | 18044 | 3290 | 5.48 | 329.03 | 109 | 58 | 90 | 51 | 52 | 46 | 88 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 30 | 663 | 17238 | 3216 | 5.36 | 321.60 |
| 30 30 31 30 10 30< | 25 | 77 | 53 | 59 | 35 | 70 | 93 | 70 | 56 | 74 | 79 | 666 | 17316 | 3223 | 5.37 | 322.33 | 110 | 58 | 85 | 50 | 53 | 30 | 89 | 136 | 81 | 40 | 50 | 672 | 17472 | 3238 | 5.40 | 323.78 |
| 10 14 15 14 15 14 15< | 20 | 70 | 54 57 | 51 | 30 43 | 114 | 80 97 | 40 50 | 130 | 92 | 130 | 762 882 | 22032 | 3448 | 5.75 | 344.78 | 112 | 53 58 | 3/ | 53 | 50 | 30 | 50 56 | 50 56 | 53 58 | 3/ | 39 56 | 496 | 12890 | 2762 | 4.64 | 276.20 |
| 9 8 9 9 7 0 8 7 0 8 7 0 8 7 0 8 7 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 <th< td=""><td>28</td><td>74</td><td>54</td><td>52</td><td>42</td><td>91</td><td>85</td><td>43</td><td>89</td><td>80</td><td>64</td><td>674</td><td>17524</td><td>3243</td><td>5.40</td><td>324.26</td><td>113</td><td>59</td><td>31</td><td>55</td><td>32</td><td>99</td><td>54</td><td>54</td><td>59</td><td>31</td><td>53</td><td>527</td><td>13702</td><td>2867</td><td>4.78</td><td>286.73</td></th<> | 28 | 74 | 54 | 52 | 42 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 89 | 80 | 64 | 674 | 17524 | 3243 | 5.40 | 324.26 | 113 | 59 | 31 | 55 | 32 | 99 | 54 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 53 | 527 | 13702 | 2867 | 4.78 | 286.73 |
| 30 80 75 90 41 81 75 90 10 80 55 90 10 80 55 90 10 80 55 90 10 80 10 10 100 100 100 100 | 29 | 84 | 52 | 53 | 37 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 126 | 83 | 136 | 819 | 21294 | 3574 | 5.96 | 357.44 | 114 | 54 | 48 | 57 | 41 | 106 | 53 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 54 | 568 | 14768 | 2977 | 4.96 | 297.67 |
| 10 10 10 <td>30</td> <td>88</td> <td>73</td> <td>59</td> <td>42</td> <td>136</td> <td>81</td> <td>40</td> <td>70</td> <td>93</td> <td>64</td> <td>746</td> <td>19396</td> <td>3411</td> <td>5.69</td> <td>341.14</td> <td>115</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>57</td> <td>50</td> <td>100</td> <td>81</td> <td>60</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>57</td> <td>601</td> <td>15626</td> <td>3062</td> <td>5.10</td> <td>306.20</td> | 30 | 88 | 73 | 59 | 42 | 136 | 81 | 40 | 70 | 93 | 64 | 746 | 19396 | 3411 | 5.69 | 341.14 | 115 | 52 | 46 | 57 | 50 | 100 | 81 | 60 | 52 | 46 | 57 | 601 | 15626 | 3062 | 5.10 | 306.20 |
| 11 10 10 10 10 100 100 100 | 31 | 58 | 88 | 57 | 44 | 56 | 53 | 37 | 114 | 80 | 132 | 719 | 18694 | 3349 | 5.58 | 334.91 | 116 | 53 | 30 | 55 | 42 | 99 | 90 | 43 | 56 | 50 20 | 54 52 | 572 | 14872 | 2987 | 4.98 | 298.72 |
| 14 8 7 8 7 8 7 10 5 7 10 5 7 10 5 7 10 5 10 5 10 10 5 0 10 5 10 10 10 | 33 | 89 | 89 | 52 | 44 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 114 | 91 | 127 | 752 | 19474 | 3425 | 5.71 | 342.51 | 118 | 51 | 39 | 52 | 32 | 58 | 93 | 58 | 151 | 62 | 56 | 652 | 16952 | 3189 | 5.32 | 318.92 |
| 35 8 8 8 8 8 8 1 1 6 8 8 1 1 6 1 1 1 1 < | 34 | 80 | 87 | 50 | 31 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 53 | 37 | 64 | 557 | 14482 | 2948 | 4.91 | 294.77 | 119 | 70 | 54 | 52 | 34 | 121 | 83 | 53 | 37 | 102 | 56 | 662 | 17212 | 3214 | 5.36 | 321.36 |
| 36 68 85 86 86 86 86 <td>35</td> <td>53</td> <td>73</td> <td>50</td> <td>48</td> <td>60</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>58</td> <td>31</td> <td>141</td> <td>612</td> <td>15912</td> <td>3090</td> <td>5.15</td> <td>308.99</td> <td>120</td> <td>76</td> <td>57</td> <td>55</td> <td>44</td> <td>129</td> <td>84</td> <td>58</td> <td>31</td> <td>119</td> <td>54</td> <td>707</td> <td>18382</td> <td>3321</td> <td>5.54</td> <td>332.10</td> | 35 | 53 | 73 | 50 | 48 | 60 | 52 | 46 | 58 | 31 | 141 | 612 | 15912 | 3090 | 5.15 | 308.99 | 120 | 76 | 57 | 55 | 44 | 129 | 84 | 58 | 31 | 119 | 54 | 707 | 18382 | 3321 | 5.54 | 332.10 |
| 10 13 14 14 14 15 15 16 16 16 16 <td>36</td> <td>65</td> <td>83</td> <td>56</td> <td>40</td> <td>139</td> <td>99</td> <td>39</td> <td>59</td> <td>31</td> <td>148</td> <td>759</td> <td>19734</td> <td>3441</td> <td>5.73</td> <td>344.10</td> <td>121</td> <td>74</td> <td>54 52</td> <td>60</td> <td>39</td> <td>115</td> <td>98 92</td> <td>59 54</td> <td>31</td> <td>98 71</td> <td>53</td> <td>681</td> <td>17706</td> <td>3259</td> <td>5.43</td> <td>325.94</td> | 36 | 65 | 83 | 56 | 40 | 139 | 99 | 39 | 59 | 31 | 148 | 759 | 19734 | 3441 | 5.73 | 344.10 | 121 | 74 | 54 52 | 60 | 39 | 115 | 98 92 | 59 54 | 31 | 98 71 | 53 | 681 | 17706 | 3259 | 5.43 | 325.94 |
| 90 90 80 44 90 80 84 70 90 80 80 80 80 <td>38</td> <td>75 55</td> <td>87 87</td> <td>60</td> <td>42 36</td> <td>126</td> <td>83</td> <td>45</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>125</td> <td>715</td> <td>13990</td> <td>3340</td> <td>5.10</td> <td>333.98</td> <td>122</td> <td>04 75</td> <td>32 88</td> <td>54 52</td> <td>48</td> <td>120</td> <td>02 98</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>73</td> <td>115</td> <td>762</td> <td>10952</td> <td>3448</td> <td>5.32</td> <td>344 78</td> | 38 | 75 55 | 87 87 | 60 | 42 36 | 126 | 83 | 45 | 52 | 46 | 125 | 715 | 13990 | 3340 | 5.10 | 333.98 | 122 | 04 75 | 32 88 | 54 52 | 48 | 120 | 02 98 | 52 | 46 | 73 | 115 | 762 | 10952 | 3448 | 5.32 | 344 78 |
| 40 1 7 7 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 7 1 18 | 39 | 89 | 89 | 58 | 44 | 70 | 93 | 44 | 53 | 30 | 111 | 681 | 17706 | 3259 | 5.43 | 325.94 | 124 | 90 | 85 | 60 | 36 | 116 | 84 | 53 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 743 | 19318 | 3405 | 5.67 | 340.45 |
| 1 1 2 7 7 7 7 1 1 9 1 9 1 9 1 9 1 9 1 | 40 | 72 | 79 | 53 | 32 | 114 | 80 | 70 | 56 | 50 | 74 | 680 | 17680 | 3257 | 5.43 | 325.70 | 125 | 52 | 70 | 60 | 32 | 130 | 81 | 56 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 729 | 18954 | 3372 | 5.62 | 337.23 |
| 1 4 5 5 1 1 1 1 9 5 1 1 1 9 5 1 1 1 9 5 1 | 41 | 72 | 57 | 57 | 37 | 118 | 97 | 31 | 51 | 39 | 64 | 623 | 16198 | 3117 | 5.20 | 311.75 | 126 | 70 | 82 | 55 | 50 | 58 | 84 | 51 | 136 | 81 | 40 | 707 | 18382 | 3321 | 5.54 | 332.10 |
| 44 7 55 51 45 16 56 51 56 25 55 37 64 96 55 55 37 64 96 16 97 54 57 54 45 66 1600 307 51 35 37 55 37 64 96 98 88 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 97 54 84 90 184 335 54 335 96 55 36 85 17 55 337 55 337 55 337 55 337 55 337 56 36 16 17 56 96 96 96 96 96 96 96 96 | 42 | 86 | 5/ | 51 | 43 | 50 | 91 | 50 | 139 | 55 27 | 148 | 854 | 21684 | 3607 | 6.01 5.21 | 360.70 | 127 | 55 62 | 85 | 50 56 | 40 52 | 100 | 96 97 | 59 47 | 56 | 55 | 3/ | 637 576 | 16562 | 2008 | 5.25 | 315.23 |
| 15 16 15 26 16 17 10 17 16 18 97 10 15 15 46 000 150 000 100 100 100 100< | 44 | 77 | 53 | 51 | 43 | 124 | 85 | 46 | 58 | 31 | 74 | 642 | 16692 | 3165 | 5.27 | 316.47 | 120 | 88 | 81 | 56 | 58 | 31 | 88 | 57 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 603 | 15678 | 3067 | 5.11 | 306.71 |
| 46 7 7 5 7 6 8 9 6 8 9 6 9 9 16 74 54 34 84 9 6 90 90 10 81 32 53 33 55 335.7 33 85 35 33 55 335.7 35 | 45 | 70 | 54 | 52 | 46 | 127 | 99 | 45 | 89 | 92 | 108 | 782 | 20332 | 3493 | 5.82 | 349.27 | 130 | 78 | 72 | 58 | 59 | 31 | 97 | 50 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 600 | 15600 | 3059 | 5.10 | 305.94 |
| 17 14 51 45 1 10 </td <td>46</td> <td>76</td> <td>57</td> <td>55</td> <td>37</td> <td>64</td> <td>80</td> <td>61</td> <td>139</td> <td>99</td> <td>116</td> <td>784</td> <td>20384</td> <td>3497</td> <td>5.83</td> <td>349.72</td> <td>131</td> <td>66</td> <td>42</td> <td>120</td> <td>54</td> <td>48</td> <td>97</td> <td>61</td> <td>60</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>646</td> <td>16796</td> <td>3175</td> <td>5.29</td> <td>317.45</td> | 46 | 76 | 57 | 55 | 37 | 64 | 80 | 61 | 139 | 99 | 116 | 784 | 20384 | 3497 | 5.83 | 349.72 | 131 | 66 | 42 | 120 | 54 | 48 | 97 | 61 | 60 | 52 | 46 | 646 | 16796 | 3175 | 5.29 | 317.45 |
| 48 48 49 50 69 48 51 69 49 74 69 49 74 66 49 74 66 49 74 66 75 44 74 66 75 44 74 66 75 44 74 75 44 74 75 44 74 75 44 75 74 75 44 75 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 74 94 15 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 74 75 74 74 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 75 74 74 75 74< | 47 | 74 | 54 52 | 51 | 46 | 160 | 89 | 69 | 89 | 80 | 104 | 816 | 21216 | 3568 | 5.95 | 356.79 | 132 | 72 | 31 | 82 | 52 | 46 | 95 95 | 43 | 80 | 87 | 121 | 709 | 18434 | 3326 | 5.54 | 332.57 |
| 0 6 7 7 1 80 0 200 533 580 352.7 15 90 1 4 7 < | 40 | 61 | 32 81 | 57 | 35 40 | 82 74 | 84 | 42 | 70 | 65 93 | 74 | 676 | 18200 | 3247 | 5.41 | 324.74 | 135 | 86 | 32 39 | 120 | 56 | 50 50 | 82 82 | 52 58 | 71 | 72 | 145 57 | 691 | 17966 | 3283 | 5.30 | 328.32 |
| 1 1 90 88 40 102 88 80 68 85 78 2088 300 5.8.1 33.7.2 53 88 70 50 10.7 90 10.7 90 20.18 33.7.2 35.7.2 | 50 | 56 | 76 | 57 | 41 | 120 | 95 | 57 | 114 | 80 | 104 | 800 | 20800 | 3533 | 5.89 | 353.27 | 135 | 77 | 50 | 102 | 51 | 39 | 91 | 54 | 72 | 86 | 57 | 679 | 17654 | 3255 | 5.42 | 325.46 |
| 52 88 70 60 51 89 72 60 50 107 94 86 80 17 94 82 86 77 53 73 2018 57 55.65 55.05 54 50 70 54 50 85 85.305 55.05 | 51 | 71 | 90 | 58 | 44 | 102 | 83 | 56 | 118 | 97 | 37 | 756 | 19656 | 3434 | 5.72 | 343.42 | 136 | 70 | 44 | 93 | 94 | 105 | 95 | 59 | 86 | 86 | 56 | 788 | 20488 | 3506 | 5.84 | 350.61 |
| 33 35 7 60 99 1 100 54 40 100 100 100 54 84 55 84 10 80 100 100 100 76 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 54 70 76 74 57 70 76 74 77 70 76 74 77 70 76 74 75 76 74 74 74 74 74 75 76 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 74 7 | 52 | 88 | 80 | 60 | 33 | 89 | 92 | 69 | 114 | 91 50 | 31 | 747 | 19422 | 3414 | 5.69 | 341.37 | 137 | 76 | 42 | 86 | 80 | 117 | 94 | 82 | 86 | 77 | 53 | 793 | 20618 | 3517 | 5.86 | 351.72 |
| 55 82 74 51 46 62 83 37 252 46 670 73 530 34 19 90 102 76 74 54 739 19214 3385 5.66 33353 56 84 70 55 35 114 80 90 55 85 114 80 90 55 85 114 80 90 55 85 72 33 41 91 60 55 53 85 50 85 50 85 85 85 <t< td=""><td>54</td><td>89 50</td><td>70</td><td>56</td><td>30</td><td>89</td><td>99 80</td><td>50 68</td><td>105</td><td>54</td><td>48</td><td>650</td><td>16900</td><td>3184</td><td>5.31</td><td>318.43</td><td>130</td><td>74 84</td><td>30 43</td><td>105</td><td>95 89</td><td>108</td><td>94 89</td><td>120</td><td>70</td><td>76</td><td>57</td><td>799 844</td><td>20774</td><td>3629</td><td>5.00</td><td>362.86</td></t<> | 54 | 89 50 | 70 | 56 | 30 | 89 | 99 80 | 50 68 | 105 | 54 | 48 | 650 | 16900 | 3184 | 5.31 | 318.43 | 130 | 74 84 | 30 43 | 105 | 95 89 | 108 | 94 89 | 120 | 70 | 76 | 57 | 799 844 | 20774 | 3629 | 5.00 | 362.86 |
| 65 84 79 85 36 70 93 95 95 95 11 12 89 85 12 100 95 11 12 89 85 12 100 95 85 15 12 89 85 15 12 89 85 12 100 95 85 10 10 15 100 10 15 100 10 10 10 1 | 55 | 82 | 74 | 51 | 46 | 126 | 83 | 38 | 72 | 52 | 46 | 670 | 17420 | 3233 | 5.39 | 323.30 | 140 | 67 | 73 | 50 | 34 | 119 | 90 | 102 | 76 | 74 | 54 | 739 | 19214 | 3395 | 5.66 | 339.53 |
| 75 73 72 75 73 72 75 74 74 75< | 56 | 84 | 79 | 55 | 36 | 70 | 93 | 36 | 50 | 53 | 30 | 586 | 15236 | 3024 | 5.04 | 302.35 | 141 | 86 | 90 | 57 | 50 | 112 | 100 | 93 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 807 | 20982 | 3548 | 5.91 | 354.81 |
| >8 >3 /2 >13 9 9 168 4 22 5.0 31 9 64 74 75 55 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 30 25 50 31 700 17420 3233 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 55 333 57 35 47 60 53 57 35 44 810 64 67 55 81 453 55 35 71 55 81 453 55 37 35 44 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 813 | 57 | 73 | 72 | 57 | 35 | 114 | 80 | 49 | 106 | 56 | 50 | 692 | 17992 | 3286 | 5.48 | 328.56 | 142 | 61 | 80 | 55 | 31 | 122 | 89 | 86 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 772 | 20072 | 3470 | 5.78 | 347.03 |
| bit bit< bit< <th< td=""><td>58 59</td><td>53</td><td>72 87</td><td>53 58</td><td>47</td><td>118</td><td>9/</td><td>32 60</td><td>8/ 63</td><td>51</td><td>39 64</td><td>649 742</td><td>16874</td><td>3182</td><td>5.30 5.67</td><td>318.19</td><td>145</td><td>56 74</td><td>73</td><td>55 56</td><td>50 30</td><td>58 129</td><td>100</td><td>117</td><td>136</td><td>53</td><td>40 37</td><td>766</td><td>19916</td><td>3457 3307</td><td>5.76</td><td>345.68</td></th<> | 58 59 | 53 | 72 87 | 53 58 | 47 | 118 | 9/ | 32 60 | 8/ 63 | 51 | 39 64 | 649 742 | 16874 | 3182 | 5.30 5.67 | 318.19 | 145 | 56 74 | 73 | 55 56 | 50 30 | 58 129 | 100 | 117 | 136 | 53 | 40 37 | 766 | 19916 | 3457 3307 | 5.76 | 345.68 |
| 61 72 75 50 48 92 81 91 84 84 91 81 91 80 83 31 11 103 71 18512 3333 5.55 332.7 147 83 71 52 31 60 53 54 48 66 31 91 83 55 333 5.55 333.7 147 83 71 52 31 60 52 53.7 71 84 81 16 63 84 85 54 48 19 64 63 127.8 33 55 333 55 333 55 331 161 63 127.8 148 90 15 70 58 41 53 57 48 19 11 117.8 118 333 55 331 15 70 15 181 118 118 118 333 55 331 15 73 135 130 117 141 141 141 141 141 141 141 <th< td=""><td>60</td><td>84</td><td>71</td><td>57</td><td>50</td><td>63</td><td>80</td><td>51</td><td>92</td><td>91</td><td>141</td><td>780</td><td>20280</td><td>3488</td><td>5.81</td><td>348.83</td><td>145</td><td>61</td><td>76</td><td>59</td><td>50</td><td>108</td><td>99</td><td>72</td><td>56</td><td>58</td><td>31</td><td>670</td><td>17420</td><td>3233</td><td>5.39</td><td>323.30</td></th<> | 60 | 84 | 71 | 57 | 50 | 63 | 80 | 51 | 92 | 91 | 141 | 780 | 20280 | 3488 | 5.81 | 348.83 | 145 | 61 | 76 | 59 | 50 | 108 | 99 | 72 | 56 | 58 | 31 | 670 | 17420 | 3233 | 5.39 | 323.30 |
| 62 86 57 60 31 91 80 88 31 15 103 712 121 123 333.2 1.4 83 71 82 31 80 83 53 54 48 663 17.28 31.6 5.36 31.10 53 54 48 663 17.6 33 71 82 71 72 53 77 74 80 77 73 87 63 77 63 57 53 81 144 54 146 64 627 16302 312.7 5.21 312.75 149 51 77 58 81 92 133 6.65 33 30 118 93 35 66 333.27 141 151 60 31 82 50 83 11 153 55 81 114 54 59 31 66 333.27 131 66 33 35 56 31 23 23 24 48 93 35 56 51 31 <t< td=""><td>61</td><td>72</td><td>57</td><td>50</td><td>48</td><td>92</td><td>83</td><td>53</td><td>37</td><td>54</td><td>124</td><td>670</td><td>17420</td><td>3233</td><td>5.39</td><td>323.30</td><td>146</td><td>82</td><td>81</td><td>51</td><td>34</td><td>58</td><td>95</td><td>50</td><td>54</td><td>59</td><td>31</td><td>595</td><td>15470</td><td>3047</td><td>5.08</td><td>304.66</td></t<> | 61 | 72 | 57 | 50 | 48 | 92 | 83 | 53 | 37 | 54 | 124 | 670 | 17420 | 3233 | 5.39 | 323.30 | 146 | 82 | 81 | 51 | 34 | 58 | 95 | 50 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 595 | 15470 | 3047 | 5.08 | 304.66 |
| 63 86 53 95 53 99 51 60 114 641 10606 3102 5.21 312.7 51 310.77 150 84 157 75 35 75 33 64 88 74 80 81 63 70 54 51 88 114 59 52 44 109 64 623 100/14 641 100/06 3102 5.21 312.7 51 115 18 11 89 851 212.6 364.4 60 24 60 32 74 100 54 81 12 166 317 5.2 31 12 60 31 81 125 680 1768 33 136 53 37 13 13 13 136 53 37 13 13 13 136 136 136 136 13 13 136 136 13 136 136 136 136 136 136 13 136 136 136 136 136 <th< td=""><td>62</td><td>86</td><td>57</td><td>60</td><td>31</td><td>91</td><td>80</td><td>58</td><td>31</td><td>115</td><td>103</td><td>712</td><td>18512</td><td>3333</td><td>5.55</td><td>333.27</td><td>147</td><td>83</td><td>71</td><td>52</td><td>31</td><td>82</td><td>83</td><td>106</td><td>53</td><td>54</td><td>48</td><td>663</td><td>17238</td><td>3216</td><td>5.36</td><td>321.60</td></th<> | 62 | 86 | 57 | 60 | 31 | 91 | 80 | 58 | 31 | 115 | 103 | 712 | 18512 | 3333 | 5.55 | 333.27 | 147 | 83 | 71 | 52 | 31 | 82 | 83 | 106 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 663 | 17238 | 3216 | 5.36 | 321.60 |
| G4 fi 53 54 53 54 54 51 323 51 55 51 435 51 33 51 51 51 332 51 35 51 35 51 35 31 51 31 55 53 31 51 333 31 51 333 31 51 333 31 53 31 150 333 31 51 333 31 51 333 31 51 333 31 51 333 51 333 31 51 333< | 63 | 86 77 | 50 52 | 50 57 | 33 | 93 | 55 | 59 | 31 | 60 110 | 64 | 641 | 16202 | 3162 | 5.27 | 316.22 | 148 | 90 51 | 72 | 55 59 | 5/ 41 | 74 53 | 80 27 | 62 | 60 127 | 52 86 | 40 52 | 635 | 16706 | 3192 | 5.32 | 319.17 |
| 66 76 57 55 81 140 54 53 30 111 81 738 1918 3393 5.66 339.31 151 69 31 82 92 59 31 91 53 37 135 680 17680 3257 5.43 3316.53 67 74 54 58 71 55 51 39 12 57 331 135 680 17680 325.7 5.33 335.63 68 45 59 31 56 50 50 71 79 611 15886 3087 515 308.73 154 59 50 102 86 53 30 60 54 48 128 670 17400 233 5.37 322.09 70 64 54 44 89 56 50 51 300 71 60 331 70 753 4400 30 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 < | 65 | 70 | 54 | 51 | 88 | 114 | 59 | 52 | 46 | 105 | 88 | 727 | 18902 | 3368 | 5.61 | 336.77 | 150 | 88 | 42 | 120 | 82 | 58 | 31 | 92 | 132 | 117 | 89 | 851 | 22126 | 3644 | 6.07 | 364.36 |
| 67 74 54 58 72 16 18616 342 57 34.21 152 60 52 74 100 54 48 93 58 31 155 705 18330 31.65 53.3 33.63 68 84 52 59 53 37 53 51 39 51 72 551 14326 2932 4.89 293.18 153 55 39 100 64 48 120 660 17240 233.3 31 55 55 56 50 57 14120 233.3 30 54 48 18 30 50 50 100 51.3 304.66 155 73 44 93 54 48 100 54 48 100 65 100 | 66 | 76 | 57 | 55 | 81 | 140 | 54 | 53 | 30 | 111 | 81 | 738 | 19188 | 3393 | 5.66 | 339.31 | 151 | 69 | 31 | 82 | 92 | 59 | 31 | 91 | 53 | 37 | 135 | 680 | 17680 | 3257 | 5.43 | 325.70 |
| 68 84 52 59 53 37 53 51 72 51 1426 2932 43 55 59 30 05 54 59 31 120 665 17290 3221 5.37 3323.09 70 86 77 56 59 31 51 39 54 68 74 59 50 56 71 79 614 48 28 670 17420 323.3 53 323.30 71 619 16094 3107 5.18 310.75 54 44 99 39 53 64 80 626 170 76 54 54 48 99 39 53 64 80 626 170 71 50 304.66 150 72 42 86 80 51 300.57 54 44 53 30 57 54 14404 490 490 490 490 490 491 490 491 490 491 491 491 51 30 | 67 | 74 | 54 | 58 | 72 | 136 | 52 | 56 | 50 | 92 | 72 | 716 | 18616 | 3342 | 5.57 | 334.21 | 152 | 60 | 32 | 74 | 100 | 54 | 48 | 93 | 58 | 31 | 155 | 705 | 18330 | 3316 | 5.53 | 331.63 |
| 99 72 88 50 53 50 50 50 71 79 611 15808< 308/73 154 59 30 102 80 53 50 00 54 48 128 100 14/40 2233 5.39 323.530 71 50 76 54 54 48 99 39 53 64 80 626 16276 312.51 310.51 30.77 51 44 93 94 56 50 54 246 57 691 16004 3107 51.8 300.77 157 86 36 17 59 76 86 44 139 54 698 184.4 300 5.50 329.98 74 56 53 37 56 60 93 53 59 31 79 567 14742 2974 4.96 297.41 159 77 53 57 44 93 <td>68</td> <td>84</td> <td>52</td> <td>59</td> <td>53</td> <td>37</td> <td>53</td> <td>51</td> <td>39</td> <td>51</td> <td>72</td> <td>551</td> <td>14326</td> <td>2932</td> <td>4.89</td> <td>293.18</td> <td>153</td> <td>55</td> <td>39</td> <td>120</td> <td>89</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>54</td> <td>59</td> <td>31</td> <td>120</td> <td>665</td> <td>17290</td> <td>3221</td> <td>5.37</td> <td>322.09</td> | 68 | 84 | 52 | 59 | 53 | 37 | 53 | 51 | 39 | 51 | 72 | 551 | 14326 | 2932 | 4.89 | 293.18 | 153 | 55 | 39 | 120 | 89 | 52 | 46 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 120 | 665 | 17290 | 3221 | 5.37 | 322.09 |
| 71 59 76 54 54 48 99 39 53 64 80 626 16276 312.5 5.21 312.50 156 72 42 86 80 51 39 44 53 30 57 554 14404 2940 4.90 293.98 72 76 83 52 52 46 81 57 53 171 608 18508 300 5.13 307.97 157 86 30 17 56 70 19994 3464 5.77 342.36 73 67 75 554 180 17 591 1536 305 5.06 303.64 188 86 43 105 89 102 86 44 51 39 54 685 1810 520 545 322.98 75 74 48 75 74 48 75 74 48 75 74 54 68 70 54 68 71 174 54 810 75 75 | 69 70 | 72 86 | 88 77 | 50 56 | 58 59 | 31 | 50 51 | 39 | 50 54 | 71 68 | 79 | 595 | 15880 | 3087 | 5.08 | 308.75 | 154 | 59 73 | 50 44 | 93 | 80 94 | 55 56 | 50 50 | 60 54 | 54 52 | 48 46 | 128 57 | 619 | 1/420 | 3233 | 5.39 | 323.30 |
| 72 76 83 52 52 46 81 57 53 37 71 608 1508 307.97 157 86 36 17 95 120 89 64 56 50 56 769 19994 3464 5.70 343.30 5.50 329.98 73 53 33 53 50 53 59 31 79 56 303 5.20 303.64 158 86 43 105 89 102 86 44 51 39 53 68 181.48 300 5.50 323.92 35.3 30 87 67 1472 297.4 496 297.41 159 14 86 70 54 57 56 36 117 95 40 57 51 31.87 71 484 87 86 306 107 55 31.87 73 58 31 50 85 51.8 30.51 50 30.54 162 56 10 368 164 57 56 <td>71</td> <td>59</td> <td>76</td> <td>54</td> <td>54</td> <td>48</td> <td>99</td> <td>39</td> <td>53</td> <td>64</td> <td>80</td> <td>626</td> <td>16276</td> <td>3125</td> <td>5.21</td> <td>312.50</td> <td>156</td> <td>72</td> <td>42</td> <td>86</td> <td>80</td> <td>51</td> <td>39</td> <td>44</td> <td>53</td> <td>30</td> <td>57</td> <td>554</td> <td>14404</td> <td>2940</td> <td>4.90</td> <td>293.98</td> | 71 | 59 | 76 | 54 | 54 | 48 | 99 | 39 | 53 | 64 | 80 | 626 | 16276 | 3125 | 5.21 | 312.50 | 156 | 72 | 42 | 86 | 80 | 51 | 39 | 44 | 53 | 30 | 57 | 554 | 14404 | 2940 | 4.90 | 293.98 |
| 73 67 72 53 53 50 88 68 83 1 71 501 15366 3036 158 86 43 105 89 102 86 44 51 39 53 698 18.148 300 5.00 329.98 74 56 53 50 35 59 31 79 567 1472 297.4 4.96 297.4 150 77 53 57 46 70 54 80 63 86 70 57 611 1714.4 232.5 33 303 5.01 333.87 333.87 333 50 331 611 39 53 53 31.87 73 53 31 63 5.01 33.87 73 53 81 64 41 75 53 31.87 73 53 31 69 52 56 50 33.87 73 53 31 69 323.49 43 53 37 55 44 63 66 76 76 <t< td=""><td>72</td><td>76</td><td>83</td><td>52</td><td>52</td><td>46</td><td>81</td><td>57</td><td>53</td><td>37</td><td>71</td><td>608</td><td>15808</td><td>3080</td><td>5.13</td><td>307.97</td><td>157</td><td>86</td><td>36</td><td>117</td><td>95</td><td>120</td><td>89</td><td>64</td><td>56</td><td>50</td><td>56</td><td>769</td><td>19994</td><td>3464</td><td>5.77</td><td>346.36</td></t<> | 72 | 76 | 83 | 52 | 52 | 46 | 81 | 57 | 53 | 37 | 71 | 608 | 15808 | 3080 | 5.13 | 307.97 | 157 | 86 | 36 | 117 | 95 | 120 | 89 | 64 | 56 | 50 | 56 | 769 | 19994 | 3464 | 5.77 | 346.36 |
| (+ 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 30 90 50 10/14/2 29/14 129 1/1 29 5/1 80 60 54 550 18/10 3209 5.48 3205.89 323.548 75 73 85 84 87 85 44 87 57 42 86 60 86 76 76 71 174/44 523 53 323.548 76 72 59 31 86 72 98 59 52 46 86 66 171 95 54 33 30 73 598 151.82 301.2 160 76 57 56 36 117 95 84 75 86 47 74 54 76 76 71 174 54 88 67 638 147.68 312 5.3 321.87 77 74 54 48 73 58 41 60 638 1648 312 51.3 313.87 313.87 | 73 | 67 | 72 | 53 | 53 | 30 | 88 | 68 | 58 | 31 | 71 | 591 | 15366 | 3036 | 5.06 | 303.64 | 158 | 86 | 43 | 105 | 89 | 102 | 86 | 44 57 | 51 | 39 | 53 | 698 | 18148 | 3300 | 5.50 | 329.98 |
| 10 10 <th< td=""><td>/4 75</td><td>20 73</td><td>55 58</td><td>5/ 31</td><td>50 51</td><td>50 30</td><td>95 07</td><td>55 58</td><td>59 54</td><td>51 18</td><td>79 73</td><td>587</td><td>14/42</td><td>2974</td><td>4.96</td><td>297.41</td><td>159</td><td>70</td><td>53 54</td><td>57</td><td>44 12</td><td>93 86</td><td>94 80</td><td>57 63</td><td>86 86</td><td>70 76</td><td>54 57</td><td>085 671</td><td>17810</td><td>3209</td><td>5.45 5.30</td><td>320.89</td></th<> | /4 75 | 20 73 | 55 58 | 5/ 31 | 50 51 | 50 30 | 95 07 | 55 58 | 59 54 | 51 18 | 79 73 | 587 | 14/42 | 2974 | 4.96 | 297.41 | 159 | 70 | 53 54 | 57 | 44 12 | 93 86 | 94 80 | 57 63 | 86 86 | 70 76 | 54 57 | 085 671 | 17810 | 3209 | 5.45 5.30 | 320.89 |
| 77 74 54 48 73 50 89 54 50 73 59 1558 305 50 89 54 50 30543 162 74 54 53 53 53 51 50 91 85 43 568 14768 2977 4.96 297.7 78 90 52 46 40 106 97 52 56 50 138 72 1800 3368 5.01 336.71 163 84 52 51 51 61 52.44 31.63 67 63 84 52 50 51 81 62 50 51 50 50 3367 163 84 52 74 55 31 60 63 64 52 50 50 51 39 64 52 76 74 54 48 63 56 53 37 55 1449 244 244 344 345 52 45 54 48 63 56 53 57 <td>76</td> <td>72</td> <td>59</td> <td>31</td> <td>86</td> <td>72</td> <td>98</td> <td>59</td> <td>52</td> <td>46</td> <td>86</td> <td>661</td> <td>17186</td> <td>3211</td> <td>5.35</td> <td>321.12</td> <td>161</td> <td>76</td> <td>57</td> <td>56</td> <td>36</td> <td>117</td> <td>95</td> <td>64</td> <td>77</td> <td>74</td> <td>54</td> <td>706</td> <td>18356</td> <td>3319</td> <td>5.53</td> <td>331.87</td> | 76 | 72 | 59 | 31 | 86 | 72 | 98 | 59 | 52 | 46 | 86 | 661 | 17186 | 3211 | 5.35 | 321.12 | 161 | 76 | 57 | 56 | 36 | 117 | 95 | 64 | 77 | 74 | 54 | 706 | 18356 | 3319 | 5.53 | 331.87 |
| 78 90 52 46 40 106 97 52 65 50 188 77 18902 3368 7.63 84 52 43 58 31 69 93 88 67 633 16458 3142 5.24 314.42 79 72 53 30 34 87 84 53 51 39 99 592 1532 3039 5.06 303.89 164 52 76 77 42 59 31 60 16 81 40 1648 3142 5.24 314.49 80 65 50 38 50 103.80 164 52 76 74 48 63 56 53 31 490 294.24 314.49 80 51 39 44 92 85 51 39 88 67 71 8363 164 416 415 5.24 314.49 400 292.24 45 52 45 52 45 54 55 131 | 77 | 74 | 54 | 48 | 73 | 50 | 89 | 54 | 53 | 30 | 73 | 598 | 15548 | 3054 | 5.09 | 305.43 | 162 | 74 | 54 | 53 | 43 | 53 | 37 | 35 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 568 | 14768 | 2977 | 4.96 | 297.67 |
| 19 1/2 5.3 3.0 44 87 84 53 1 39 89 59/2 15.99/2 303.89 164 52 76 57 42 59 31 60 136 81 40 634 16484 3145 52.4 314.49 80 86 51 39 44 92 85 56 50 92 127 724 18343 361 5.00 33.80 166 57 47 48 63 56 50 37 555 1440 244 90 294.24 81 86 51 39 44 92 85 51 39 63 16484 3145 5.24 314.49 166 57 84 52 45 52 46 54 56 58 31 130 288 4.80 288.89 287.81 288.89 287.81 283.83 287.81 283.25 168 38 45 50 52 35 44 551 133.80 287.81 4.80 | 78 | 90 | 52 | 46 | 40 | 106 | 97 | 52 | 56 | 50 | 138 | 727 | 18902 | 3368 | 5.61 | 336.77 | 163 | 84 | 52 | 54 | 37 | 58 | 31 | 69 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 633 | 16458 | 3142 | 5.24 | 314.24 |
| 60 50 <th< td=""><td>79 80</td><td>72</td><td>53 56</td><td>30 50</td><td>34 19</td><td>87 62</td><td>84 06</td><td>53 56</td><td>51</td><td>39</td><td>89</td><td>592 724</td><td>15392</td><td>3039</td><td>5.06</td><td>303.89</td><td>164</td><td>52 76</td><td>76 74</td><td>57 54</td><td>42</td><td>59 54</td><td>31 49</td><td>60 62</td><td>136</td><td>81 52</td><td>40 37</td><td>634 555</td><td>16484</td><td>3145</td><td>5.24</td><td>314.49</td></th<> | 79 80 | 72 | 53 56 | 30 50 | 34 19 | 87 62 | 84 06 | 53 56 | 51 | 39 | 89 | 592 724 | 15392 | 3039 | 5.06 | 303.89 | 164 | 52 76 | 76 74 | 57 54 | 42 | 59 54 | 31 49 | 60 62 | 136 | 81 52 | 40 37 | 634 555 | 16484 | 3145 | 5.24 | 314.49 |
| 82 77 53 55 34 91 85 43 91 85 43 91 85 43 967 17082 3201 5.34 320.14 167 78 79 57 47 53 50 53 53 1380 2878 4.80 <t< td=""><td>80 81</td><td>86</td><td>50 51</td><td>.50 39</td><td>48 44</td><td>03 92</td><td>90 85</td><td>50 51</td><td>39</td><td>92 58</td><td>127 89</td><td>634</td><td>16624 16484</td><td>3145</td><td>5.24</td><td>314.49</td><td>105</td><td>70 57</td><td>74 84</td><td>54 52</td><td>40 45</td><td>54 52</td><td>48 46</td><td>54</td><td>50 56</td><td>58</td><td>31</td><td>535 535</td><td>144.50</td><td>2942 2889</td><td>4.90</td><td>294.24 288.89</td></t<> | 80 81 | 86 | 50 51 | .50 39 | 48 44 | 03 92 | 90 85 | 50 51 | 39 | 92 58 | 127 89 | 634 | 16624 16484 | 3145 | 5.24 | 314.49 | 105 | 70 57 | 74 84 | 54 52 | 40 45 | 54 52 | 48 46 | 54 | 50 56 | 58 | 31 | 535 535 | 144.50 | 2942 2889 | 4.90 | 294.24 288.89 |
| 83 70 54 52 37 93 88 67 99 18434 332.6 5.54 332.57 168 63 84 54 37 56 50 52 53 54 48 551 14326 2932 4.89 293.18 84 76 57 52 45 136 81 40 744 19344 3407 5.68 340.68 169 68 74 52 41 51 93 06 52 46 513 13338 282.9 4.71 282.89 85 74 56 50 52 53 54 48 51 14326 2932 4.89 293.18 85 74 54 56 38 57 56 340.68 169 68 74 52 41 51 39 30 60 52 46 513 13338 282.9 4.71 326.28 38 74 74 93 80 70 158 50 80 80 70 </td <td>82</td> <td>77</td> <td>53</td> <td>55</td> <td>34</td> <td>91</td> <td>85</td> <td>43</td> <td>91</td> <td>85</td> <td>43</td> <td>657</td> <td>17082</td> <td>3201</td> <td>5.34</td> <td>320.14</td> <td>167</td> <td>78</td> <td>79</td> <td>57</td> <td>47</td> <td>53</td> <td>30</td> <td>43</td> <td>54</td> <td>59</td> <td>31</td> <td>531</td> <td>13806</td> <td>2878</td> <td>4.80</td> <td>287.81</td> | 82 | 77 | 53 | 55 | 34 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 91 | 85 | 43 | 657 | 17082 | 3201 | 5.34 | 320.14 | 167 | 78 | 79 | 57 | 47 | 53 | 30 | 43 | 54 | 59 | 31 | 531 | 13806 | 2878 | 4.80 | 287.81 |
| 84 76 57 52 45 136 81 40 744 19344 3407 5.68 340.68 169 68 74 51 39 30 60 52 46 513 13338 2829 4.71 28289 85 74 54 56 38 56 53 37 514 13346 2832 4.72 283.17 170 84 73 58 41 93 80 70 158 50 89 796 20696 352.4 5.87 323.82 4.71 282.89 80 70 158 50 89 796 20696 352.4 5.87 323.82 4.71 283.17 170 84 73 58 41 93 80 70 158 50 89 796 20696 352.4 5.87 323.82 4.71 328.47 360 74 58 41 93 80 70 158 50 89 796 20696 552.4 5.87 323.82 5.87 | 83 | 70 | 54 | 52 | 37 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 93 | 88 | 67 | 709 | 18434 | 3326 | 5.54 | 332.57 | 168 | 63 | 84 | 54 | 37 | 56 | 50 | 52 | 53 | 54 | 48 | 551 | 14326 | 2932 | 4.89 | 293.18 |
| 26.24 5.26 8/30 20 70 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 20 | 84 | 76 74 | 57 | 52 | 45 | 136 | 81 52 | 40 | 136 | 81 52 | 40 27 | 744 | 19344 | 3407 | 5.68 | 340.68 | 169 | 68 84 | 74 72 | 52 59 | 41 | 51 | 39 | 30 | 60 | 52 | 46 | 513 704 | 13338 | 2829 | 4.71 | 282.89 |
| | 65 | 74 | .,4 | 50 | 20 | 50 | 55 | 57 | 50 | 55 | 51 | 514 | 10004 | 2032 | 4.72 | 203.17 | 1/0 | 04 | 13 | 50 | +1 | 73 | 00 | 70 | 1.30 | 50 | 09 | 190 | 20090 | <i>332</i> 4 | Total = | 54864.13 |



Fig. 3. Multi-facility allocation with (a) nearest neighbour logic, and (b) optimization of Eq. (4) - (7) through Lingo.

The results presented in Figure 3 corroborate the suitability of the mathematical model defined by Eq. (4) - (7) and the use of MILP. Finally, the future values of these costs and the expected savings are considered to assess the pertinence of this decision. Table 4 presents the future value of C_{ij} through a period of 15 years for the following scenarios: BS (baseline with one distribution center), NN (allocation with nearest neighbour logic and six centers), and MLP (optimal allocation with MILP and six centers). The initial investment (*InitInv*) due to the infrastructure required to open the new six distribution centers is also included. As presented, if the decision of opening the six distribution centers is delayed, may increase from \$2,209,200 at year 0 to \$6,536,800 at year 15. The analysis presented in Table 5 shows that, within the first year, *InitInv* can be compensated by the savings obtained with six centers, independent of the allocation's optimality.

| | 14 | | ture varue | or eg mo | ugn u perk | <i>Ju of 15 j</i> | curb. | |
|---------|-------------|-------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------------------|--------------|--------------|
| t | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
| BS | \$5,193,700 | \$5,583,200 | \$6,002,000 | \$6,452,100 | \$6,936,000 | \$7,456,200 | \$8,015,400 | \$8,616,600 |
| NN | \$3,071,700 | \$3,302,100 | \$3,549,700 | \$3,816,000 | \$4,102,200 | \$4,409,800 | \$4,740,600 | \$5,096,100 |
| MLP | \$2,209,200 | \$2,374,900 | \$2,553,000 | \$2,744,500 | \$2,950,400 | \$3,171,600 | \$3,409,500 | \$3,665,200 |
| InitInv | \$300,000 | \$322,500 | \$346,688 | \$372,689 | \$400,641 | \$430,689 | \$462,990 | \$497,715 |
| t | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 |
| BS | \$9,262,800 | \$9,957,500 | \$10,704,000 | \$11,507,000 | \$12,370,000 | \$13,298,000 | \$14,295,000 | \$15,367,000 |
| NN | \$5,478,300 | \$5,889,200 | \$6,330,900 | \$6,805,700 | \$7,316,100 | \$7,864,800 | \$8,454,700 | \$9,088,800 |
| MLP | \$3,940,100 | \$4,235,600 | \$4,553,300 | \$4,894,800 | \$5,261,900 | \$5,656,500 | \$6,080,800 | \$6,536,800 |
| InitInv | \$535,043 | \$575,172 | \$618,309 | \$664,683 | \$714,534 | \$768,124 | \$825,733 | \$887,663 |

Table 4. Future value of C_{ii} through a period of 15 years.

Table 5. Future value of savings through a period of 15 years.

| | Table 5. I deale value of savings through a period of 15 years. | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| t | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | | | | | | |
| BS | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | | | |
| NN | 2,122,000 | 2,281,100 | 2,452,200 | 2,636,100 | 2,833,800 | 3,046,400 | 3,274,900 | 3,520,500 | | | | | | |
| MLP | 2,984,500 | 3,208,300 | 3,448,900 | 3,707,600 | 3,985,600 | 4,284,600 | 4,605,900 | 4,951,400 | | | | | | |
| t | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | | | | | | |
| BS | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | | | |
| NN | 3,784,500 | 4,068,300 | 4,373,500 | 4,701,500 | 5,054,100 | 5,433,100 | 5,840,600 | 6,278,700 | | | | | | |
| MLP | 5,322,700 | 5,721,900 | 6,151,100 | 6,612,400 | 7,108,300 | 7,641,400 | 8,214,500 | 8,830,600 | | | | | | |

4 Conclusions and Future Work

The effective delivery of items throughout the supply chain is crucial for the production process. Likewise, the costs associated with the delivery of raw materials and inventory costs are crucial to maintain the company with a high level of competitiveness. In this context, the proposed multi-facility allocation model with future value assessment can provide companies with useful

decision-making resources when important economic resources are compromised. Under this scenario, the development of comprehensive cost metrics and MILP models can provide effective solutions to reduce costs and improve profits.

Allocation is an important aspect of distribution services. It must be studied considering the dynamic behavior of costs because an optimal solution in the present may not be economically sustainable. Also, economic losses due to delayed decisions may reduce the potential economic benefits of the planned actions or investments.

As future work, the present work can be extended on the following points:

- Develop a capacitated multi-facility location-allocation model with a periodic vehicle routing scheme (CMFLAwPVRP).
- Improve the cost metric with additional aspects such as asymmetric distances and delays.
- Design a metaheuristic to solve the CMFLAwPVRP model.
- Consider future value with variable interest rates.

References

[1]Yamakawa, P., Del Castillo, C., Baldeón, J., Espinoza, LM, Granda, JC, & Vega, L.: Technological model of service integration for the Peruvian SMEs. Lima, Peru: ESAN (2010).

[2]Mora, L.: Gestión Logística en Centros de Distribución, Bodegas y Almacenes. Bogotá, Colombia: ECOE Ediciones (2011).

[3]Vallhonrat., J.M., Corominas, A.: Localización, Distribución en Planta y Manutención. Barcelona, España: Marcombo (1991).

[4]Yate-Jauregui, C.M.: A PSO Algorithm for the Drinking Water Supply Problem in the Event of a Disaster in the City of Bucaramanga. Eng. Thesis, Faculty of Industrial Engineering, Santo Tomás Bucaramanga University, Colombia (2020).

[5]Burbano-Ruiz, J.: Presupuestos - Enfoque Moderno de Planeación y Control de Recursos. Colombia: McGraw-Hill (1995). [6]Polo, A. Study of the Relationship between Integration and Productivity in the Supply Chain through the Joint Use of

Qualitative and Quantitative Tools. Master's Thesis, Faculty of Engineering, Universidad de La Sabana, Colombia (2013).

[7]Eslava, J.: Análisis Económico-Financiero de Las Decisiones de Gestión Empresarial. Madrid, España: ESIC Editorial (2003).

[8]Covert, R.P., Philip, G.C.: An EOQ model for items with Weibull distribution deterioration. AIIE Transactions, 5 (4), 323-326 (1973).

[9]Vance, D.: Financial Analysis and Decision Making: Tools and Techniques to Solve Financial Problems and Make Effective Business Decisions. New York, United States of America: McGraw-Hill (2003).